

# Peralta Community College District

Berkeley City College  
College of Alameda  
Laney College  
Merritt College



## Career Technical Education (CTE) Program Review Handbook

Fall 2015  
Version 3.



# Table of Contents

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Purpose and Goals  | 1.  |
| Components in the Process                                      | 2.  |
| The CTE Program Review Team                                    | 3.  |
| Core Data Elements   | 4.  |
| Definitions  | 6.  |
| The CTE Program Review Narrative Report                        | 7.  |
| Appendices   | 18. |
| • <i>Appendix A. Program Review Resource Requests Template</i> | 19. |
| • <i>Appendix B. Integrated Goal Setting Template</i>          | 20. |
| • <i>Appendix C. Validation Template</i>                       | 21. |

# Purpose and Goals

The information gathered during the program review process provides the basis for informed decision making in the Peralta Community College District. Comprehensive Instructional Program Review is a systematic process for the collection, analysis, and interpretation of data concerning a program or department and its curriculum. It provides program and/or departmental accountability by collecting, analyzing and disseminating information that will inform integrated planning, resource allocation, and decision-making processes.

The primary goals are to:

- Ensure quality and excellence of academic programs.
- Provide a standardized methodology for review of instructional areas.
- Provide a mechanism for demonstrating continuous quality improvement, producing a foundation for action.
- Identify effective and exemplary practices.
- Strengthen planning and decision-making based upon current data.
- Identify resource needs.
- Develop recommendations and strategies concerning future directions and provide evidence supporting plans for the future, within the department, at the college and at the District level.
- Inform integrated planning at all levels within the College and the District.
- Ensure that educational programs reflect student needs, encourage student success, and foster improved teaching and learning.
- Provide a baseline document for demonstration of continuous improvement and use as a reference for future annual program updates.

# Components in the Process

The CTE Program Review process, which occurs every three years, consists of answering a set of questions designed to aid in the examination of a discipline, department or program. These questions direct faculty to examine the curriculum, pedagogy, assessment results, and resource areas related to student success and to analyze findings in order to develop a plan that will improve the quality of teaching and learning.

The primary components in the CTE Program Review process include:

- The CTE Program Review Team
- Core data elements
- Completion of a CTE Program Review Narrative Report every three years
- Validation of the CTE Program Review Report
- Completion of three reporting templates (found in the appendix). They are:
  - The *CTE Program Review Resource Requests Template* in which to summarize key resource needs.
  - The *Integrated Goal Setting Template* in which to set goals, objectives and action plans based upon the Comprehensive Instructional Program Review findings in alignment with PCCD Strategic Goals and Institutional Objectives.
  - The *Validation Process Form* in which to document the validity of the program review.

- 
- Annual Program Updates (APUs), which review progress in meeting goals identified in the CTE Program Review, are completed in the alternate years within the CTE Program Review three year-cycle.
- 

Thus, the recommendations and priorities from the CTE Program Review feed directly into the development of departmental and/or unit plans. In turn, the departmental and/or unit plans serve as the driving mechanisms in formulation of updated educational, budget, technology and facilities plans.

# The CTE Program Review Team

Each discipline, department or program at the college will assemble a Comprehensive Instructional Program Review Team at the College that is comprised of the following members:

- Department Chair, Program Coordinator, or discipline designee.
  - Division Dean
  - Two additional faculty members, if applicable.
  - All faculty members within a department are encouraged to participate in the comprehensive Instructional Program Review process, although participation is not mandatory.
  - A college body, such as a validation committee or institutional effectiveness committee, comprised of faculty outside of the discipline, department or program.
- 

The CTE Program Review Team will analyze the core data elements, course outlines, SLO assessment results, and complete the CTE Program Review Narrative Report.

---

**Validation:** A designated college body, such as a validation committee or institutional effectiveness committee, will review the CTE Program Review Narrative Report to ensure completeness of the narrative report, the resource needs template, and the goal setting template.

The validation committee will complete the validation form, including signatures, included in Appendix C and make recommendations to the Vice President of Instruction.

---

# CTE Core Data Elements

## Part I. District Office

The *District Office of Institutional Research* will provide the following data to the College discipline, department or program by October 1<sup>st</sup> of each comprehensive program review year.

- Total enrollment data for each discipline, department or program (unduplicated) for the last three years disaggregated by age, gender, ethnicity and special populations.
- Enrollment data for individual courses, by time of day, fall, spring and summer sessions, for the last three years.
- FTES per FTEF (productivity) by course and discipline, department or program for the last three years.
- College productivity rate for the last three years.
- Productivity for comparable CTE departments for the last three years.
- Degrees and certificates awarded, by discipline, department or program disaggregated by age, sex and ethnicity for the last three years.
- Total degrees and certificates awarded by the college, per year, for the last three years.
- Retention rates by course and discipline, department or program for the last three years.
- Overall college retention rate.
- Retention rates for comparable CTE departments for the last three years.
- Course completion (student success) rates, by course and discipline, department or program for the last three years.
- College course completion rates for the last three years
- Faculty Demographics: Full-time/part-time, age, gender, ethnicity
- Labor Market Information and Trends:
  - Data by O\*NET classification (from Career Zone California) on new and replacement job projections and wages
  - Data/Reports from Centers of Excellence (COE) on industry sectors
  - EMSI data or other sources of EDD data

---

## Part II. College

A. The *Office of Instruction and/or the Curriculum Specialist* at the College will provide the following to each discipline, department or program.

- A list of active courses in the discipline, department or program and the date they were last updated/approved.
- A list of degrees and certificates

---

B. The *Office of Instruction and/or SLO Coordinators* at the College will provide the following to each discipline, department or program.

- A list of courses and programs that depicts the current status of assessments at the course and program levels.

---

C. The *Office of Instruction* at the College will provide the following to each discipline, department or program.

- A copy of the PCCD Strategic Goals and Institutional Objectives for the current academic year.
- A copy of the College Goals and Objectives for the current academic year.



# Definitions

**Discipline:** An individual area of study within a department/program. Each discipline consists of all the courses in the Master Course file that make of the discipline. This is the baseline level of instruction and is linked to a Taxonomy of Programs (TOP) code. TOP is a classification system for academic programs in the California Community Colleges.

**Department/Program:** An organized sequence of courses, or series of interdisciplinary courses, leading to a defined objective, a degree, a certificate, a diploma, a license, or transfer to an institution of higher education (Title 5 Section 55000).

**FTEF (Full Time Equivalent Faculty):** Also known as load equivalency. A full-time instructor teaching 15 lecture hours per week for one semester = 1.0 FTEF. One lecture hour = 50 minute instructional period. One lab hour = .8 of one lecture hour equivalent. This is a semester, or term, measure.

**FTES (Full Time Equivalent Student):** This measure is used as the basis for computation of state support for California Community Colleges. For example, one student attending 15 hours a week for 35 weeks (one academic year) generates 1 FTES.

**WSCH:** Weekly Student Contact Hours. For a particular class, Weekly Contact Hours = number of class hours per week, and WSCH for the class = total number of weekly contact hours for all students in the class as of census date.

To compute the FTES generated by a 17.5 week semester class use the formula:

$$\text{FTES} = \text{WSCH} \times 17.5 / 525$$

For example, a class of 40 students meeting 3 hours per week generates 120 WSCH, and so

$$\text{FTES} = 120 \times 17.5 / 525 = 4.0$$

**FTES/FTEF (Productivity):** The ratio of full-time equivalent students to full-time equivalent instructors. This is a measure of class size and will differ across disciplines and types of classes. For lecture classes, Productivity = enrollment/2. For example, if there are 35 students in a lecture class, productivity =  $35/2 = 17.5$ .

**Retention:** The percent of students earning any grade but “W” in a course or series of courses. To compute retention for a class, take class completion with grade other than “W” and divide by enrollment at census. Grade other than W = A, B, C, D, F, I, Pass, No Pass, In Progress, Report Delayed, No Grade

**Student Success:** Course completion rate with a grade “C” or better.

# The CTE Program Review Report

## 1. College: Laney College

**Discipline, Department or Program: Culinary Arts**

**Date: October 1, 2015**

**Members of the Comprehensive Instructional Program Review Team:  
Lorriann Raji, Chantal Martin & Dean Peter Crabtree**

**Members of the Validation Team:**

---

## 2. Narrative Description of the Discipline, Department or Program:

The Laney College Culinary Arts Program offers two majors: Cooking/Restaurant Management and Baking and Pastry, which has the distinction of being the one of few of its kind in the Metropolitan Bay Area. Our majors are designed to provide students with the technical trade theory and the practical laboratory experience resulting in the documented skill set that enables them to achieve career success in the culinary arts industry. Graduates of the Laney College Culinary Arts Program apply their culinary skills and knowledge anywhere, from travel and work in hotels or on cruise ships to starting their own businesses.

We strongly encourage all students to complete the necessary coursework to receive an Associate of Science (AS) degree. By completing the AS coursework versus the certificate only, students have an advantage in the workforce and open more doors to promotion than without. Completing the AS coursework also assists student who plan to make the transition to four-year institutions.

With regard to Student employment and career success, we vigilantly maintain a database of currently active employment opportunities. In addition, we maintain an Advisory Committee comprised of Hospitality professionals who inform our program of industry trends and needs.

All of this combines to support the Laney College mission of offering optimal student support services, as well as working with other organizations and institutions to address the local and global educational needs of our community to maximize access and student learning outcomes.

---

## 3. Curriculum:

Please answer the following questions and/or insert your most recent curriculum review report (within the past 3 years) here.

Attach the Curriculum Review Report or Answer these Questions:

**Curriculum Review Planning Checklist - Laney College  
2015-2016**

|   |
|---|
| <b>Name of the Discipline:</b> Culinary Arts  |
| <b>Date of Report:</b>  |
| <b>List Faculty Involved in Developing this Report:</b> Lorriann Raji; Chantal Martin   |
| <p>Please complete this evaluation before your presentation date with the curriculum committee. We ask that you use the checklist below to let us know where you are in your curriculum updating and your departmental methods for analyzing and evaluating the contents of course and degree/certificate offerings. Let us know what methods you use to maintain the integrity of academic standards and achieve consistency within the instructional program?</p> <p>Also, please use CurricuNet to review all courses taught in your department and any certificates or degrees offered. Use the dates for the Active courses (red) to check the date of last up date.</p> <p>CTE courses should be updated every two years, and courses in other disciplines every three years.</p> <p>(please use additional pages as necessary)</p> |

**Current Courses**

| Course Number | Course Name                                      | Date of most recent update | In current catalog ? | In State inventory ? | In PROMT ? | Are course SLOs and evaluation methods in C-net? | Are the course SLO evaluation tools included in the COR assignment section? | Is this course part of a program ? | NOTES: What will be done with this course, when and by whom? |
|---------------|--|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|------------|--|---|------------------------------------|--|
| 31            | Garde Manger & Contemporary American Bistro      | 1/1/06                     | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes        | No   | No  | Yes                                | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR                 |
| 33            | Managing Food Sanitation                         | 10/3/11                    | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes        | Yes  | No  | Yes                                | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR                 |
| 41            | International Cuisine                            | 1/1/96                     | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes        | No   | No  | Yes                                | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR                 |
| 48GA          | Meat Analysis                                    | 9/17/07                    | No                   | Yes                  | No         | No   | No  | No                                 | Deactivation ; F15; LR                                       |
| 50            | Principles of Food, Beverage, and Labor Controls | 1/1/96                     | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes        | No   | No  | Yes                                | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR                 |
| 51            | Supervision in                                   | 4/4/14                     | Yes                  | Yes                  | Yes        | No   | No  | Yes                                | Update   |

|     |   |          |     |     |     |     |    |     |  |
|-----|---|----------|-----|-----|-----|-----|----|-----|--|
|     | the Hospitality Industry                |          |     |     |     |     |    |     | textbooks and course content; S16; LR        |
| 53  | Nutrition for Culinary Professionals    | 2/7/14   | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 200 | Special Projects Laboratory             | 1/1/96   | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | No  | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 203 | Introduction to Baking                  | 10/17/08 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 204 | Basic Patisserie                        | 9/16/08  | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 205 | Artisan Bread                           | 9/16/08  | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 206 | Advanced Cake Decorating                | 10/3/08  | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 207 | International Patisserie                | 9/16/08  | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 208 | Confiserie (Candy and Chocolate Making) | 9/6/13   | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 209 | Contemporary Plated Desserts            | 11/13/12 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 212 | Culinary Fundamentals                   | 9/17/07  | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 214 | Hospitality Careers and Skills          | 9/17/07  | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course                  |

|     |  |         |     |     |     |    |    |     |   |
|-----|--|---------|-----|-----|-----|----|----|-----|---|
|     | Development  |         |     |     |     |    |    |     | content;<br>S16; LR                             |
| 215 | Culinary Math Fundamentals                               | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |
| 216 | Food Science Nutrition                                   | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |
| 217 | Recipe, Formulas, and Food Costs                         | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |
| 218 | Ingredients and Equipment                                | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |
| 219 | Introduction to Sanitation                               | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |
| 222 | Banquet and Institutional Serving and Cooking Techniques | 1/1/07  | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | No  | Deactivation ; F15; LR                          |
| 223 | Soups, Stocks, and Sauces                                | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |
| 224 | Dynamics of Heat Cooking                                 | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |
| 225 | Introduction to Garde Manger and Food Presentation       | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |
| 226 | Introduction to Baking for Chefs                         | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |
| 227 | Quantity Food Production Lab                             | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content;<br>S16; LR |

|       |  |         |     |     |     |     |    |     |  |
|-------|--|---------|-----|-----|-----|-----|----|-----|--|
| 229   | Culinary Career Success Strategies                   | 10/3/08 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 232   | Dining Room Service and Management                   | 9/17/07 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No  | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 233   | How to Open a Baking Business                        | 9/17/10 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 234   | Introduction to Cooking Technique                    | 3/21/14 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No  | Update textbooks and course content; S16; LR |
| 248   | Culinary Art   | 9/19/07 | No  | Yes | No  | No  | No | No  | Deactivation ; F15; LR                       |
| 248GA | Banquet and Institutional Serving Cooking Techniques | 9/19/07 | No  | Yes | No  | No  | No | No  | Deactivation ; F15; LR                       |
| 248GB | Introduction to Food Service Management              | 9/19/07 | No  | Yes | No  | No  | No | No  | Deactivation ; F15; LR                       |
| 252A  | General Baking I                                     |         | No  | Yes | Yes | No  | No | No  | Deactivation ; F15; LR                       |
| 348A  | Culinary Art   | 9/19/07 | No  | Yes | No  | No  | No | No  | Deactivation ; F15; LR                       |

### Course Proposals in Progress

| Course Number | Course Name | Originator | Type of Proposal (update, reactivation or deactivation) | Date Submitted | Current Status | Are course SLOs and evaluation methods in C-net? | Are the course SLO evaluation tools included in the COR assignment section? | Are proposed changes based on assessment findings? | Part of a program? | NOTES: What will be done with this proposal, when and by whom? |
|---------------|-------------|------------|---|----------------|----------------|--|---|--|--------------------|--|
|               |             |            |   |                |                |  |   |  |                    |  |
|               |             |            |   |                |                |  |   |  |                    |  |
|               |             |            |   |                |                |  |   |  |                    |  |
|               |             |            |   |                |                |  |   |  |                    |  |

### Active Programs

| Name of Program                                  | In State inventory? | In PROMT? | Are PLOs and evaluation methods in C-net? | Are all courses in the program current? | Can this program be completed more than 50% online? | NOTES: What will be done with this program, when and by whom? |
|--|---------------------|-----------|---|---|---|---|
| Baking and Pastry Certificate of Achievement     | Yes                 | Yes       | Yes                                       | No                                      | No  | Update courses in program of study; S16; LR                   |
| Baking and Pastry Associate in Sciences          | Yes                 | Yes       | Yes                                       | No                                      | No  | Update courses in program of study; S16; LR                   |
| Cooking Certificate of Proficiency               | No                  | Yes       | Yes                                       | No                                      | No  | Update courses in program of study; S16; LR                   |
| Restaurant Management Certificate of Achievement | Yes                 | Yes       | Yes                                       | No                                      | No  | Update courses in program of study; S16; LR                   |
| Restaurant Management Associate in Sciences      | Yes                 | Yes       | Yes                                       | No                                      | No  | Update courses in program of study; S16; LR                   |

### Program Proposals in Process

| Name of Program                                  | Originator    | Type of proposal (update, reactivation or deletion) | Date submitted | Current Status        | Are PLOs and evaluation methods in C-net? | Are all courses in the program current? | Can this program be completed more than 50% online? | NOTES: What will be done with this program proposal, when and by whom? |
|--|---------------|---|----------------|-----------------------|---|---|---|--|
| Baking and Pastry Certificate of Achievement     | Lorriann Raji | update  | 4/14/14        | Modification at State | Yes                                       | No                                      | No  | Program in process at State; waiting on approval                       |
| Baking and Pastry Associate in Sciences          | Lorriann Raji | update  | 4/14/14        | Modification at State | Yes                                       | No                                      | No  | Program in process at State; waiting on approval                       |
| Restaurant Management Certificate of Achievement | Lorriann Raji | update  | 4/14/14        | Modification at State | Yes                                       | No                                      | No  | Program in process at State; waiting on approval                       |
| Restaurant Management Associate in Sciences      | Lorriann Raji | update  | 4/14/14        | Modification at State | Yes                                       | No                                      | No  | Program in process at State; waiting on approval                       |

- Have all of your course outlines of record been updated or deactivated in the past three years? If not, list the courses that still need updating and specify when your department will update each one, within the next three years.

- As seen in the above chart, we have assessed the needs of the department and our students and have a plan to update our curriculum to meet State standards.
  - What are the discipline, department or program of study plans for curriculum improvement (i.e., courses or programs to be developed, enhanced, or deactivated)?
    - See above chart.
  - Please list your degrees and/or certificates. Can any of these degrees and/or certificates be completed through Distance Education (50% or more of the course online)? Which degree or certificate?
    1. Baking & Pastry Certificate of Achievement and Associate in Sciences
    2. Restaurant Management Certificate of Achievement and Associate in Sciences
    3. Culinary Certificate of Proficiency
    - None of these can be completed through Distance Education
- 

#### 4. Assessment:

Please answer the following questions and attach the TaskStream “At a Glance” report for your discipline, department, or program for the past three years. Please review the “At a Glance” reports and answer the following questions.

##### *Questions:*

- How does your discipline, department or program ensure that students are aware of the learning outcomes of the courses and instructional programs in which they are enrolled? Where are your discipline, department or program course and program SLOs published? (For example: syllabi, catalog, department website, etc. If they are on a website, please include a live link to the page where they can be found)
  - Our department ensures that students are aware of the learning outcomes of the courses and instructional programs in which they are enrolled by mandating that all SLOs are published on all course syllabi. We are in the process of uploading all program syllabi to our website: [http://www.laney.edu/wp/culinary\\_arts/](http://www.laney.edu/wp/culinary_arts/)
- Briefly describe at least three of the **most significant changes/improvements** your discipline, department or program made in the past three years as a response to course and program assessment results. Please state the course number or program name and assessment cycle (year) for each example and attach the data from the “Status Report” section of TaskStream for these findings.
  - Improvement 1. We are unable to access the information on TaskStream, because it is under review and locked. However, we do know we made the following changes:
  - In CULIN 229 we aligned the course work to symmetrically match actual job search functions. We did this in order to make it more relevant and useful for the students.



- Improvement 2. We are unable to access the information on TaskStream, because it is under review and locked. However, we do know we made the following changes:
  - In CULIN 53 we added a research project which requires the students to find current nutritional information for specific but common diseases. We did this because many of the students either have or know of people that suffer from these ailments. This again, adds relevancy and usefulness to the students' learning experience.
  - Improvement 3. We are unable to access the information on TaskStream, because it is under review and locked. However, we do know we made the following changes:
  - In CULIN 219 we partnered with the California Food Safety Handlers, an online agency which offers instruction and certification for food service workers. This again, not only added usefulness and relevancy to the students learning experience but also gave them the potential for economic gain.
- Briefly describe three of the **most significant examples** of your discipline, department or program plans for course and /or program level improvement for the next three years as result of what you learned during the assessment process. Please state the course number or program name and attach the data from the "Assessment Findings and Action Plan" section for each example.  
We are unable to directly retrieve the information specified in this section as our programs are currently under review and access is locked. However:

Plan 1.

- First and second semester culinary labs would be greatly improved if the facilities were operational and up to Health and Safety code. We are operating in a seriously diminished capacity as a result of sanctions emanating from such violations.

Plan 2.

- We are eagerly awaiting the demolition and rebuild of the Student Center which houses the first and second semester kitchen lab facilities. We have had a meeting with Dr. Ikaro regarding the time line of this construction. He has assured us that it will commence in the near future and be completed in 2017.

- Describe how assessment results for Distance Education courses and/or programs compare to the results for the corresponding face-to-face classes.

- N/A

- Describe assessment results for courses with multiple sections. Are there similar results in each section?

- We have 4 classes with multiple sections (CULIN 215, 216, 217, 219). Our assessment for either section is equivalent. There are similar results in each section as seen when faculty members compare their experiences and data.
- Describe your discipline, department or program participation in assessment of institutional level outcomes (ILOs).
  - We participated in last semester’s assessment of ILO #1 “Communication.” Faculty member had students do presentations and complete forms for the assessment committee. See below.

**LANEY COLLEGE  
INSTITUTIONAL LEARNING OUTCOME #1 ASSESSMENT RUBRIC  
Oral Presentations - Fall 2014**

***Communication***

*Students will effectively express and exchange ideas through various modes of communication.*

|                                     |                     |
|-------------------------------------|---------------------|
| Course discipline and number        | Culinary 53         |
| Name of Instructor (s)              | Chantal Martin      |
| E-mail of instructor (s)            | cmartin@peralta.edu |
| Number of students in the class(es) | 35                  |

- Make sure the relevant course SLO is mapped to this ILO in TaskStream.
- Collect course assessment information as usual, and enter your assessment plan, assessment findings, and action plan into TaskStream. Alternatively, use the Word forms. These can be found at:  
<http://www.laney.edu/wp/assessment/forms/>
- Upload your assignment prompt, your grading rubric, and the results into TaskStream.
- Use one of the four rubrics provided – choose the one that is most appropriate for your class. (Writing, Oral Presentation, Media, or the Visual/Performing Arts)
- Tally the number of students in each category for each aspect of the rubric and enter the numbers in the appropriate boxes on the rubric.
- Turn in the completed rubric and three copies/samples of student work. Make sure to get a signed permission form from the students providing the samples. We will use the samples of student work as evidence in our college-wide portfolio.
- **If you teach one section of a multi-section class, you and your colleagues should submit one rubric tally that captures the information for all of the sections combined.**

**Reflection Questions: (please include your responses here)**

1. What strengths did you find when you evaluated your students’ work? (What were they good at?)

Overall, they presented quite well: clear enunciation, good projection and confidence! In terms of strengths, I think their confidence was paramount. It enabled them to interact with the audience. The majority of the

students were able to impart a substantial portion of the information contained in their research papers by “talking” to the audience, as opposed to “reading.”

2. What are the problem areas you noticed in student work? What could be done to improve the problem areas you discovered?

Too much “copying and pasting!” Although this seems like a “writing” issue (and it is), it is also a significant issue with regard to giving oral presentations. Because the students do not “create” the material themselves, they become “stiff” and often lose their train of thought when trying to present it.

With regard to improving this issue, I think it is important that we (instructors) continuously and vigorously inform students as to the myriad issues and responsibilities associated with using other people’s intellectual property.

## INSTITUTIONAL LEARNING OUTCOME #1 COMMUNICATION – ORAL PRESENTATION

*ILO #1 - Communication: Students will effectively express and exchange ideas through various modes of communication.*

|   | Excellent | Good | Fair | Needs Work | Not Done |
|---|-----------|------|------|------------|----------|
| <p><b>Content/Message</b></p> <p>Main message is clear, well-stated, appropriately repeated, and strongly supported with a variety of examples, illustrations, quotations, statistics, etc. Verbally cites research sources if appropriate.</p> | 8         | 17   | 7    | 3          |          |
| <p><b>Organization</b></p> <p>Presentation is well-organized with appropriate introduction, body and conclusion. Good transitions make the whole presentation cohesive.</p>   | 8         | 20   | 7    |            |          |

|  |   |    |    |   |  |
|--|---|----|----|---|--|
| <b>Delivery</b><br><br>Posture, gestures, eye contact, vocal clarity and expressiveness all make the speaker appear polished and confident. Speaker is engaging throughout the presentation. | 3 | 10 | 15 | 7 |  |
|--|---|----|----|---|--|

- How are your course and/or program level outcomes aligned with the institutional level outcomes?  
Please describe and attach the “Goal Alignment Summary” from TaskStream.

|                   | <b><u>Institutional Learning Outcome #1: Communication</u></b><br>Students will effectively express and exchange ideas through various modes of communication. | <b><u>Institutional Learning Outcome #2: Critical Thinking and Problem Solving</u></b><br>Students will be able to think critically and solve problems by identifying relevant information, evaluating alternatives, synthesizing findings and implementing effective solutions. | <b><u>Institutional Learning Outcome #3: Career Technical Skills</u></b><br>Students will demonstrate technical skills in keeping with the demands of their field of study. | <b><u>Institutional Learning Outcome #4: Global Awareness, Ethics and Civic Responsibility</u></b><br>Students will be prepared to practice community engagement that addresses one or more of the following: environmental responsibility, social justice and cultural diversity. | <b><u>Institutional Learning Outcome #5: Professionalism</u></b><br>Students will demonstrate professional behavior and communication skills in the workplace. |
|-------------------|--|--|---|--|--|
| Culinary Arts     |  |  |   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 201 |  |  |   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 202 |  |  |   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 203 | Mapped   |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 204 |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 205 |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 206 |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 207 |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 208 |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 209 |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 212 |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added   |  |  |
| Culinary Arts 214 |  |  | Mapped  |  |  |

|   |  |  |                                 |  |                |
|---|--|--|---------------------------------|--|----------------|
| Culinary Arts 215                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 216                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 217                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 218                       |  |  | Mapped                          |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 219                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 223                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 224                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 225                       |  |  | Mapped                          |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 226                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 227                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 229                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 232                       |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 250                       |  |  |                                 |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 31                        |  |  | Mapped                          |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 33                        |  |  | Mapped                          |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 41                        |  |  | Mapped                          |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 50                        |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 51                        |  |  | Mapped/Assessment Measure Added |  |                |
| Culinary Arts 53                        |  |  |                                 |  |                |
| Culinary Arts: Baking AS                |  |  | Mapped                          |  | Mapped Measure |
| Culinary Arts: Baking CA                |  |  | Mapped                          |  |                |
| Culinary Arts: Cooking CA               |  |  | Mapped                          |  |                |
| Culinary Arts: Restaurant Management AS |  |  | Mapped                          |  |                |
| Culinary Arts: Restaurant Management CA |  |  |                                 |  |                |

**See above chart.**

---

**5. Instruction:**

- Describe effective and innovative strategies used by faculty to involve students in the learning process.

- The **foundation** of our program is student involvement. The majority of student “class” time is in lab, where they are directly and physically engaged with the subject matter being taught. Our faculty members use a modified version of the Socratic method in their instruction. Students first learn through observation “demos,” which they are then called upon to recreate. During this “recreation” process, instructors are able to observe student performance. Depending upon the instructor observation and subsequent evaluation, lesson plans may be modified or changed to better engage and inform the students.
- How has new technology been used by the discipline, department or program to improve student learning?
  - After the fundamental course SLOs have been attained, students are exposed to technologically new/advanced techniques, like: molecular gastronomy, sous-vide cooking application and advanced confiserie (including sugar work, molds and painting) and cake design.
- How does the discipline, department, or program maintain the integrity and consistency of academic standards with all methods of delivery, including face to face, hybrid, and Distance Education courses?
  - N/A (only method of instruction is face to face).
- How do you ensure that Distance Education classes have the same level of rigor as the corresponding face-to-face classes?
  - N/A
- Briefly discuss the enrollment trends of your discipline, department or program. Include the following:
  - Overall enrollment trends in the past three years

CULIN Enrollment

|           | Term        |           |             |             |           |             |             |           |             |
|-----------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|
|           | 2012 Summer | 2012 Fall | 2013 Spring | 2013 Summer | 2013 Fall | 2014 Spring | 2014 Summer | 2014 Fall | 2015 Spring |
| Headcount | 110         | 412       | 361         | 103         | 357       | 321         | 75          | 287       | 298         |

- An explanation of student demand (or lack thereof) for specific courses.

Lack of demand at this particular time is based on a stronger economy in the Bay Area. Cooking jobs are abundant and we lose our students sometimes mid-semester to job offers that they cannot refuse.

- Productivity for the discipline, department, or program compared to the college

productivity rate.

### CULIN Productivity Rate

|              | Term           |              |                |                |              |                |                |              |                |
|--------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|
|              | 2012<br>SUMMER | 2012<br>FALL | 2013<br>SPRING | 2013<br>SUMMER | 2013<br>FALL | 2014<br>SPRING | 2014<br>SUMMER | 2014<br>FALL | 2015<br>SPRING |
| Productivity | 16.50          | 18.02        | 15.97          | 12.41          | 15.73        | 14.99          | 10.98          | 15.04        | 13.60          |

### Laney College Productivity Rate

| Productivity | Term           |              |                |                |              |                |                |              |                |
|--------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|
|              | 2012<br>SUMMER | 2012<br>FALL | 2013<br>SPRING | 2013<br>SUMMER | 2013<br>FALL | 2014<br>SPRING | 2014<br>SUMMER | 2014<br>FALL | 2015<br>SPRING |
| Total        | 16.76          | 17.63        | 17.41          | 16.40          | 16.53        | 16.48          | 15.05          | 15.40        | 15.41          |

- Salient factors, if known, affecting the enrollment and productivity trends you mention above.
- Unknown
  
- Are courses scheduled in a manner that meets student needs and demands? How do you know?
  - Yes, those students who work during their matriculation in the program tend to do so part-time and in the evening.
  - Our evidence is anecdotal but generally unanimous and repeated.
  
- Recommendations and priorities.
  - Stronger advertising within the community; networking with local restaurants and community based organizations to create pathways for our students.
  - Offering alternative scheduling for students who work or have outside commitments (i.e., evening classes or weekend college).

---

## 6. Student Success:

- Describe course completion rates (*% of students that earned a grade "C" or better or "Credit"*) in the discipline, department, or program for the past three years. Please list each course separately.

How do the discipline, department, or program course completion rates compare to the college course completion standard?

## CULIN Student Success Percentages from 2012-2015

|          | Term        |           |             |             |           |             |             |           |             |
|----------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|
|          | 2012 Summer | 2012 Fall | 2013 Spring | 2013 Summer | 2013 Fall | 2014 Spring | 2014 Summer | 2014 Fall | 2015 Spring |
| Success% | 74.19%      | 63.07%    | 61.42%      | 66.67%      | 64.15%    | 68.06%      | 76.67%      | 66.14%    | 69.91%      |

## Laney College Completion Standard

|          | Term        |           |             |             |           |             |             |           |             |
|----------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|
|          | 2012 Summer | 2012 Fall | 2013 Spring | 2013 Summer | 2013 Fall | 2014 Spring | 2014 Summer | 2014 Fall | 2015 Spring |
| Success% | 74.07%      | 68.72%    | 66.34%      | 73.40%      | 66.34%    | 67.98%      | 72.79%      | 68.95%    | 69.11%      |

## Department/discipline course completion rates

| Success | Course                               | Term        |           |             |             |           |             |             |           |             |
|---------|--------------------------------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|
|         |                                      | 2012 Summer | 2012 Fall | 2013 Spring | 2013 Summer | 2013 Fall | 2014 Spring | 2014 Summer | 2014 Fall | 2015 Spring |
|         | CULIN 31 - GARDE MANGER/BISTRO       | NA          | 83.78%    | 91.67%      | NA          | 95.45%    | 72.22%      | NA          | 93.55%    | 82.61%      |
|         | CULIN 33 - MANAGING SANITATION       | NA          | 75.00%    | 81.08%      | NA          | 72.09%    | 76.47%      | NA          | 69.05%    | 57.89%      |
|         | CULIN 41 - INTERNATNL CUISINE        | NA          | 96.97%    | 92.31%      | NA          | 87.50%    | 94.74%      | NA          | NA        | 90.63%      |
|         | CULIN 50 - FOOD/BEVERAGE/LABOR       | NA          | 100.00%   | 89.29%      | NA          | 87.50%    | 90.00%      | NA          | NA        | 91.18%      |
|         | CULIN 51 - SUPERVIS/HOSPITALITY      | NA          | 100.00%   | 89.29%      | NA          | 87.50%    | 94.74%      | NA          | NA        | 94.12%      |
|         | CULIN 53 - NUTRITION/CULINARY        | NA          | 67.44%    | 78.79%      | NA          | 50.00%    | 63.16%      | NA          | 94.29%    | 76.19%      |
|         | CULIN 200 - SPECIAL PROJ LAB         | NA          | NA        | NA          | NA          | NA        | NA          | NA          | NA        | 100.00%     |
|         | CULIN 203 - INTRODUCTION TO BAKING   | 82.93%      | 65.85%    | 64.29%      | 94.29%      | 72.50%    | 66.67%      | 93.75%      | 73.53%    | 70.27%      |
|         | CULIN 204 - BASIC PATISSERIE         | NA          | 66.67%    | 69.23%      | NA          | 63.41%    | 84.85%      | NA          | 83.78%    | 74.07%      |
|         | CULIN 205 - ARTISAN BREADS           | NA          | 84.62%    | 76.47%      | NA          | 70.97%    | 84.62%      | NA          | 87.50%    | 84.62%      |
|         | CULIN 206 - ADVANCED CAKE DECORATING | NA          | 76.92%    | 81.82%      | NA          | 66.67%    | 88.46%      | NA          | 88.24%    | 67.86%      |
|         | CULIN 207 - INTERNATIONAL PATISSERIE | NA          | 94.44%    | 70.00%      | NA          | 92.31%    | 90.48%      | NA          | 94.12%    | 100.00%     |
|         | CULIN 208 - CANDY & CHOCOLATE MAKING | NA          | 100.00%   | 81.82%      | NA          | 100.00%   | 90.91%      | NA          | 93.75%    | 100.00%     |
|         | CULIN 209 - CONTEMP PLATED DESSERTS  | NA          | 89.47%    | 100.00%     | NA          | 86.67%    | 100.00%     | NA          | 92.86%    | 89.47%      |
|         | CULIN 212 - CULIN FUNDAMENTALS       | NA          | 60.76%    | 45.31%      | NA          | 63.41%    | 67.69%      | NA          | 61.76%    | 65.96%      |
|         | CULIN 214 - HOSPITALITY CAREERS      | NA          | 56.41%    | 47.50%      | NA          | 45.57%    | 40.26%      | NA          | 50.00%    | 46.81%      |
|         | CULIN 215 - CULIN MATH FUNDAMEN.     | 77.42%      | 64.81%    | 59.22%      | 81.25%      | 60.19%    | 57.30%      | 76.19%      | 56.04%    | 56.06%      |
|         | CULIN 216 - FOOD SCIENCE/NUTRI.      | NA          | 34.78%    | 33.98%      | 40.00%      | 62.11%    | 73.97%      | 70.00%      | 66.67%    | 57.14%      |
|         | CULIN 217 - RECIPE/FORMULA/COST      | 74.36%      | 62.75%    | 57.65%      | 86.36%      | 63.16%    | 61.43%      | 76.47%      | 62.96%    | 61.02%      |
|         | CULIN 218 - INGREDIENTS/EQUIPMNT     | NA          | 46.25%    | 45.88%      | NA          | 50.00%    | 45.33%      | NA          | 55.56%    | 43.18%      |
|         | CULIN 219 - INTRO TO SANITATION      | 61.29%      | 33.05%    | 46.67%      | 46.88%      | 53.23%    | 55.21%      | 63.64%      | 61.45%    | 65.00%      |
|         | CULIN 222 - BANQUET/INST SERVING     | 69.23%      | NA        | NA          | 75.00%      | NA        | NA          | 62.50%      | NA        | NA          |
|         | CULIN 223 - SOUPS/STOCKS/SAUCES      | NA          | 73.53%    | 61.90%      | NA          | 64.29%    | 50.00%      | NA          | 46.88%    | 62.86%      |
|         | CULIN 224 - DYNAMICS/HEAT COOKNG     | NA          | 70.97%    | 57.50%      | NA          | 62.96%    | 72.34%      | NA          | 45.45%    | 66.67%      |
|         | CULIN 225 - GARDE MANGER/PRESENT     | NA          | 68.57%    | 52.63%      | NA          | 67.86%    | 84.78%      | NA          | 35.29%    | 72.97%      |
|         | CULIN 226 - INTRO/BAKING/CHEFS       | NA          | 62.96%    | 71.43%      | NA          | 71.43%    | 74.19%      | NA          | 72.00%    | 84.62%      |



|                                       |    |               |               |               |               |               |               |               |               |
|---------------------------------------|----|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| CULIN 227 - QUANTITY FOOD PROD.       | NA | 81.25%        | 84.62%        | NA            | 78.57%        | 90.91%        | NA            | 75.86%        | 88.24%        |
| CULIN 229 - CAREER SUCCESS STRATEGIES | NA | 69.23%        | 70.59%        | NA            | 60.00%        | 75.00%        | NA            | 64.71%        | 63.64%        |
| CULIN 232 - DINING RM SRV/MGMT        | NA | 76.92%        | 91.30%        | NA            | 70.37%        | 70.59%        | NA            | 92.86%        | 94.74%        |
| <b>Grand Total</b>                    |    | <b>74.19%</b> | <b>63.07%</b> | <b>61.42%</b> | <b>66.67%</b> | <b>64.15%</b> | <b>68.06%</b> | <b>76.67%</b> | <b>66.14%</b> |

Discussion:

- See above chart for direct comparison. With regard to attrition, a large percentage of 1<sup>st</sup> semester students “load up their plate” and then find they have to cut back at some point during the semester. This and employment are the two primary factors accounting for “attrition” in our program. However, we find in the summer, that the shortened span, reduced allowable number of units and increased intensity of coursework results in higher student retention and success.
- Describe course completion rates in the department **for Distance Education** courses (100% online) for the past three years. Please list each course separately. How do the department’s Distance Education course completion rates compare to the college course completion standard?
  - No DE courses have ever been offered in the CULIN program.
- Describe course completion rates in the department **for Hybrid** courses (less than 100% online) for the past three years. Please list each course separately. How do the department’s Hybrid course completion rates compare to the college course completion standard?
  - No Hybrid courses have ever been offered in the CULIN program.
- Are there differences in course completion rates between face to face and Distance Education/hybrid courses? If so, how does the discipline, department or program deal with this situation?

n/a

- How do you assess the overall effectiveness of Distance Education course?

n/a

- Describe the discipline, department, or program retention rates (After the first census, the percent of students earning any grade but a “W” in a course or series of courses). for the past three years. How does the discipline, department, or program retention rate compare to the college retention standard?

CULIN Retention

| Term        |           |             |             |           |             |             |           |             |  |
|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|--|
| 2012 Summer | 2012 Fall | 2013 Spring | 2013 Summer | 2013 Fall | 2014 Spring | 2014 Summer | 2014 Fall | 2015 Spring |  |

### Laney College Retention Standard

|            | 2012<br>Summer | 2012<br>Fall | 2013<br>Spring | 2013<br>Summer | 2013<br>Fall | 2014<br>Spring | 2014<br>Summer | 2014<br>Fall | 2015<br>Spring |
|------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|----------------|--------------|----------------|
| Retention% | 84.30%         | 83.71%       | 79.07%         | 84.20%         | 81.31%       | 79.46%         | 84.68%         | 81.53%       | 81.25%         |

#### Discussion:

- Our department often has a higher retention rate than Laney College's. Which we think it is remarkable given the market and industries forces affecting our program.
- What has the discipline, department, or program done to improve course completion and retention rates? What is planned for the next three years?
  - As mentioned earlier in this document, a good number of students don't complete the courses and/program due to job offers.
  - The other part of this population, we feel are not properly prepared for college and the demands of our coursework and expectations of being a college student. These students should be counseled to take entry-level general education courses and/or college success strategies to build their self-confidence and knowledge base.
- What has the discipline, department, or program done to improve the number of degrees and certificates awarded? Include the number of degrees and certificates awarded by year, for the past three years. What is planned for the next three years?

|                            | 2012-2013 | 2013-2014 | 2014- 2015 | Total |
|----------------------------|-----------|-----------|------------|-------|
| CULIN                      |           |           |            |       |
| Baking and Pastry (AS)     | 4         | 9         | 7          | 20    |
| Cooking (CP)               | 14        | 26        | 14         | 54    |
| Restaurant Management (AS) | 8         | 10        | 11         | 29    |
| Baking and Pastry (CA)     | 20        | 28        | 16         | 64    |
| Restaurant Management (CA) | 25        | 22        | 19         | 66    |

As stated before in this document when discussing courses, many students do not complete degree requirements due to leaving the program early for work. The department is currently exploring ways to improve enrollment management and marketing. Some of the proposed ideas are implementing new curriculum to create externship possibilities for students to work while getting school credit and having possible job connections once they graduate. Also offering alternative scheduling for classes for working students to still be able to complete their coursework.

## 7. Human, Technological, and Physical Resources (including equipment and facilities):

- Describe your current level of staff, including full-time and part-time faculty, classified staff, and other categories of employment.

Full-time faculty headcount \_\_\_\_\_ 6 \_\_\_\_\_

Part-time faculty headcount \_\_\_\_\_ 6 \_\_\_\_\_

Total FTEF faculty for the discipline, department, or program \_\_\_\_\_ 6 \_\_\_\_\_

Full-time/part-time faculty ratio \_\_\_\_\_ 50% \_\_\_\_\_

Classified staff headcount \_\_\_\_\_ 7 \_\_\_\_\_

- Describe your current utilization of facilities and equipment.
  - At Laney College we have 3 main lab areas: Student Center/Cafeteria, Baking and Pastry Production, and Bistro Kitchens. For our needs, each area is required to have gas, electric, water, and counter/table space.
  - Our main hurdle currently is the Student Center kitchens. We have been expecting a major renovation/restructuring of the lab space in this building. Due to the project being postponed for 10 years, in spite of available funding, we are now requiring students to prep food in another building and then push carts of food through the causeway to feed the cafeteria. Why? Because, this past summer (summer 2015), the fire marshal red-tagged (completely shut down) the student center kitchen because the exhaust hoods did not meet safety code. Students are now required to share lab space in the Bistro Kitchen, which severely handicaps the other cooking courses and their educational experience. Our educational integrity and reputation has hit rock bottom.
- What are your key staffing needs for the next three years? Why? Please provide evidence to support your request such as assessment data, student success data, enrollment data, recommendations from your advisory committee, changes in certification requirements, and/or other factors.
  - We have a desperate need (truly, we cannot overemphasize how important this is for our department and students) for a full-time dedicated CULIN CTE counselor that would assist students through their orientation to their graduation and beyond at Laney. This person would also compile our student success data and assist in networking in community for job, externships and professional development. We would also want them to be responsible for alumni association and related activities and organizing our advisory committee.
  - We also have need a program assistant (this individual could be an adjunct faculty member who would do this position part-time in essence having a full load) who would deal with departmental

paperwork (program funding, grant applications), give tours to associated groups and dignitaries, and oversee facilities' maintenance.

- We also desperately need a designated CTE IT webmaster to create, maintain and grow the department websites and online presence.
- What are your key technological needs for the next three years? Why? Please provide evidence to support your request such as assessment data, student success data, enrollment data, recommendations from your advisory committee, changes in certification requirements, and/or other factors.
  - **We need:**
    - color food safe printer (\$700) to print logos and images on pastry work
    - printer/fax/scanner units in all faculty offices
    - repair of overhead projectors and sound technology in all 3 existing smart rooms/labs
    - 3 dedicated desktop computers for each existing room (to work in tandem with projectors and sound components)
    - Video cameras and projectors for 5 lab spaces, so students can actually view instructor demos
- What are your key facilities needs for the next three years? Why? Please provide evidence to support your request such as assessment data, student success data, enrollment data, recommendations from your advisory committee, changes in certification requirements, and/or other factors.
  - The red-tagged hoods that the fire department has eliminated from using in the student center must be repaired immediately, as well as any other issues that will impact the department from offering the courses needed for course completion.
  - For example, it is imperative that the portable kitchens for the student center “swing space” are constructed and installed so the department can begin demolition and construction of the state-of-the-art student center kitchen. The lab space is necessary, in order for our program to follow State guidelines in terms of curriculum and assessment. This is vital, in order for our program to remain valid and active within the California Community College system.
- In addition, we also need the following:
  - new bread oven (appx \$25,000)

- new automatic sheet pan washer (appx \$10,000)
- new proof box (appx. \$10,000)
- gelato machine for student center
- industry standard swinging doors between Bistro and kitchen
- gasket repair/replacement of all walk-in unit doors, especially freezer doors in bakery and bistro kitchens (so temperature is constant and ice no longer falls from ceiling)
- repair/replace under counter 5ft sandwich prep table
- repair/replace steam table
- main cooking line hood maintenance (in jeopardy of losing whole system) ALSO, in danger of being cited by fire marshal for active cooking without exhaust
- repair/replace tile flooring by 3 compartment sink (hazard of slipping)
- all walk-ins in Bistro must be services
- gas line needs to be evaluated and corrected in the Bistro kitchen. It is a well known fact that it is inadequate for the amount of equipment it is “supposed” to service
- unblock Bistro back-sink drain; it has been out-of-service for over one year- a sanitation hazard
- need HVAC to function in candy kitchen. Temperature consistently exceeds 75 degrees, making the instruction and application of many core techniques impossible to perform
- Need lights replaced over candy kitchen ovens
- In short, we have urgent program demands that are not being met. In order to meet these demands, we need to have a dedicated preventive maintenance program engineer whose sole responsibility is to maintain the culinary arts’ facilities and their specific equipment. Without this, the increased volume and severity of equipment failure will result in program stoppage.

- **Please complete the Comprehensive Instructional Program Review Prioritized Resource Requests Template included in Appendix A.**

---

**8. Community, Institutional, and Professional Engagement and Partnerships:**

**Part A.**

- Discuss how faculty and staff have engaged in institutional efforts such as committees, presentations, and departmental activities. Please list the committees that full-time faculty participate in.
  - Member of full-time faculty participate in the following:
    - Curriculum committee
    - CTE-Advisory committee
    - Faculty Senate
  
- Discuss how faculty and staff have engaged in community activities, partnerships and/or collaborations.
  - We have hosted local Girl Scouts for afternoon tea.
  - We are engaging in a partnership with Tanya Holland from the Brown Sugar Kitchen for internships and competition.
  - Hosted the ACF Western regional convention.
  - We are engaging in a partnership with the Berkeley Adult School’s “on ramp” program facilitating motivated students into the culinary industry.
  - We participate in the annual CTE open house.
  - We have our program listed on the Cal Jobs website.
  
- Discuss how adjunct faculty members are included in departmental training, discussions, and decision-making.

**Part B.**

- What are the job placement rates for your discipline/department/program for the past three years?

|    | Students with Jobs       |                      | Spring/Fall Semester 2014 |                 |
|----|--------------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|
| 1. | <b>Avery Milbrodt</b>    | Gregoires Restaurant | Cook \$18.hr.             | 1/18/14         |
| 2. | <b>Auriyon Jacobs</b>    | Spoonrocket          | Plater \$8.hr             | 2/7/14          |
| 3. | <b>Crystal Nieves</b>    | Gregoire             | Cook \$35K                | 2/20/14 3 years |
| 4. | <b>George St. Claire</b> | RCI Cruise Ship      | Banquet Chef              | 2/27/14         |
| 5. | <b>Paris Ford</b>        | The new Parkway      | Cook \$10.                |                 |
| 6. | <b>Stanley Wyche</b>     | Facebook             | Cook \$15.                | 3/4/14          |
| 7. | <b>Luis Garcia</b>       | Meals On Wheels      | Cook \$14.                |                 |
| 8. | <b>Charmaine Drona</b>   | Cupcakin Bakery      | Baker \$12.               |                 |
| 9. | <b>Leslie Thorne</b>     | Cupcakin Bakery      | Baker \$12.               |                 |
| 10 | <b>Desiree Saunders</b>  | Berkeley Bowl        | Baker                     |                 |

|    |                           |                               |   |          |
|----|---------------------------|-------------------------------|---|----------|
| 11 | <b>Corina Beasley</b>     | Senior Living                 | Cook \$40.K                               |          |
| 12 | <b>David Chu</b>          | La Farine bakery              | Baker                                     | 3/30/14  |
| 13 | <b>Yuki Nishitani</b>     | Craftsmen and Wolves          | Intern                                    | 3/1/14   |
| 14 | <b>Jackie Andrade</b>     | Republic of Cake.<br>Oakley   | Baker \$13.                               | 5/15/14  |
| 15 | <b>Kassia Korkus</b>      | Blue Bottle Coffee            | Pastry Asst. \$ 13.                       | 5/20/14  |
| 16 | <b>James Wilson</b>       | Bull Valley Roadhouse         | Line Cook                                 | 5/20/14  |
| 17 | <b>Nathaniel Jackson</b>  | The Smoking Pig<br>Fremont    | Line Cook                                 | 5/20/14  |
| 18 | <b>Karen Bayuk</b>        | Sur La Table cooking<br>class | Assistant cook                            | 7/7/14   |
| 19 | <b>Sanders Phoebe</b>     | Episcopal comm.<br>services   | Chef/ Instructor<br>46K + benefits        | 7/17/14  |
| 20 | <b>Lena Foster</b>        | Milton Academy, Mass.         | Assistant Sous<br>Chef/ Instructor<br>39K | 1/9/2014 |
| 21 | <b>Leondre Stansberry</b> | Applebys                      | Line Cook \$10.                           | 1/2/2014 |
| 22 | <b>Dustin Vann</b>        | Campton Place                 | Line Cook \$17.                           | 7/24/14  |
| 23 | Saltz, Jacob              | Annabelles Bar & Bistro       | Waiter/Host \$13.                         | 8/20/14  |
| 24 | <b>Wyanna Foster</b>      | Cavallo Point                 | Pastry Cook                               | 8/20/14  |
| 25 | <b>Valerie Afrolian</b>   | Bread Project                 | Director of<br>Programs                   | 8/20/14  |
| 26 | <b>Ronnie Miranda</b>     | Victory Burger                | Cook                                      | 8/20/14  |
| 27 | <b>Steven Riley</b>       | Jolly Roger                   | Cook \$13.25                              | 9/18/14  |
| 28 | <b>Fernanda Maura</b>     | Chez Panisse                  | Intern/cook                               | 9/18/14  |
| 29 | <b>Kareisha Broussard</b> | Pecan Restaurant              | Cook                                      | 12/4/14  |
| 30 | <b>Luis Lopez</b>         | Facebook                      | Line Cook \$15+                           | 1/27/15  |
| 31 | <b>Ernest Carroll</b>     | Facebook                      | Prep cook \$13+                           | 1/27/15  |
| 32 | <b>Desiree Saunders</b>   | Shattuck Hotel                | Pastry Chef \$14+                         | 1/29/15  |
| 33 | <b>Kong Ng</b>            | Claremont Hotel               | Waiter                                    | 2/18/15  |
| 34 | <b>Corina Beasley</b>     | Cardinal Point                | Line Cook 13.50                           | 3/3/15   |
| 35 | <b>Linda Love</b>         | Cardinal Point                | Line Cook \$13.                           | 3/3/15   |
| 36 | <b>Nathaniel Jackson</b>  | Golden Gate Fields            | Cook \$16.                                | 3/17/15  |
| 37 | <b>Ryan Coe</b>           | Cal Dining UC berkeley        | Cook \$16.19                              | 3/17/15  |
| 38 | <b>Sarika Oliver</b>      | Golden Gate Fields            | Cook \$16.                                | 4/8/2015 |
| 39 | <b>Melanie Allen</b>      | Cal Dining & Acrobat          | Cook \$16.                                | 4/13/15  |
| 40 | <b>James Ball</b>         | Acrobat Outsourcing           | Cook \$13-                                | 4/28/15  |
| 41 | <b>Dwayne Bailey</b>      | Acrobat Outsourcing           | Cook \$15.                                | 4/28/15  |
| 42 | <b>Bobby Nelson</b>       | Whole Foods                   | Cook \$14.                                | 4/28/15  |
| 43 | <b>Lloyd Kinoshita</b>    | Whole Foods                   | Cook \$14.                                | 4/28/15  |
| 44 | <b>Moises Aquino</b>      | Paula Le Duc Catering         | Cook \$15.                                | 4/28/15  |
| 45 |                           |                               |   |          |

|    |                             |  |                             |         |
|----|-----------------------------|--|-----------------------------|---------|
| 46 | <b>Andrew Henderson</b>     | Lake Park Senior center                | Cook                        | 5/11/15 |
| 47 | <b>Samantha Swain</b>       | Lungomare                              | Pastry Cook<br>\$13.50      | 5/18/15 |
| 48 | <b>Zekeia Harrison</b>      | Specialtys                             | Production baker<br>\$12.50 | 5/20/15 |
| 49 | Sheba McClendon             | Oakmont Senior Citizen Home<br>Alameda | Cook                        | 5/20/15 |
| 50 | <b>Suzi Tooman</b>          | Susiecakes                             | Pastry Cook<br>\$11.25      | 3/23/15 |
| 51 | <b>Benita Sidhu</b>         | Sweet Treat Stop                       | Pastry Cook \$13.           | 7/4/15  |
| 52 | <b>John Bowlsby</b>         | Denver Biscuit CO.<br>Denver Colorado  | Pastry Cook \$14.           | 7/15/15 |
| 53 | <b>Steven Mitchell</b>      | Its All Good Bakery                    | Decorators<br>Asst.\$12.    | 7/15/15 |
| 54 | <b>Joyce Low</b>            | A Grandfair Market                     | Pastry cook \$13.           | 8/25/15 |
| 55 | <b>Sandy Ngyuen</b>         | Restaurant/Bakery San<br>Diego         | Cook \$15.                  | 8/25/15 |
| 56 | <b>Rebecca</b>              | Church Cook                            | \$12.                       | 8/25/15 |
| 57 | <b>Neyva Salazar</b>        | Speiskammer Alameda<br>Pastry Chef     | \$13.                       | 8/25/15 |
| 58 | <b>Jason Spencer</b>        | Warehouse Bar&<br>Grill,Oakland        | \$15.                       | 8/2013  |
| 59 | <b>Mario Johnson</b>        | Goodfellas Pizzeria, SF                | \$17.00                     | 8/2015  |
| 60 | <b>Nydia Cardona</b>        | Paris Baguette, Cake<br>Decorator      | \$12.25                     | 8/20/15 |
| 61 | <b>Britney Domingo</b>      | Netflix Call center                    | \$18.                       | 9/10/15 |
| 62 | <b>Sherif Rederic Pratt</b> | Cal Dining                             | \$16.                       |         |
| 63 | <b>Drew Gonzales</b>        | Bon marche Bistro/ Café                | \$42K                       | 9/8/15  |
| 64 | <b>Morgan Rockwell</b>      | Montclair Baking                       | \$16. Per hour              | 7/1/15  |
| 65 | <b>Melia</b>                | White Barn Inn,<br>Vermont             |                             | 7/1/15  |
| 66 | <b>Talia Bueno</b>          |  |                             |         |
| 67 | <b>Jason Spencer</b>        | Cal Dining                             | \$16. Per hour              | 10/2015 |
| 68 | <b>Saulo Avila</b>          | Mi Pueblo Bakery                       | \$12.50                     | 10/15   |

- What are the projected job openings in your discipline for the next three years?
  - The hospitality industry is the second largest employer in the US after the Military.
  - Government figures indicate robust growth for the foreseeable future.
  
- How is the discipline/department program responding with regard to labor market demand?
  - We are pumping them out as fast as we can! We share job information with our students and allow companies to directly recruit on campus. We participate in the job fair on campus each year.



- Do you have an advisory board in place? Has it met regularly? Please provide a list of your advisory board members and attach agendas and meeting minutes from the past year.
  - We have an advisory board in place. However, in keeping with the spirit of our industry-hospitality, it is rather informal. We meet for lunches and talk on the phone. Neither of which are recorded formally via minutes.
- Please describe the number of activities and recommendations resulting from advisory committee meetings that have occurred in the past three years. What information was presented that required changes to be made to your program?
  - The number of meetings or “activities” has been considerable (over 15). As a result of these activities, we have increased the amount of lab time allocated to the following baking and cooking techniques:
    - Hybrid Desserts
    - Gluten-Free breads, pastries and cakes
    - Diabetic-friendly Confectionary incorporating “natural” sugar substitutes
    - Seafood charcuterie
    - Artisanal Preparation Methods: Pickling, Fermenting, Smoking, and Sous-Vide
    - Non-Wheat Noodles/Pasta
    - Molecular Gastronomy Applications, particularly: foams, powderizing and spherification
    - Organic and Non-GMO foods for cafeteria consumption
- Does your program require state or national licensing? Please explain. What is your licensing status?
  - N/A
- Do your students participate in third party certifications? What are their success rates (include the # of students, # of certifications, etc.)
  - Yes, all of our students are required to take coursework in Safety and Sanitation. The primary SLO in each of these classes is successful attainment of California State-Sanctioned Certification. The first semester class yields a California State Food Handler Card. The third semester class yields California State ServSafe Food Protection Manager Certification.

Is your discipline/department/program working with a Deputy Sector Navigator? If so, in which sector? Briefly describe your discipline/department/program’s work with the Deputy Sector Navigator.

- Yes, our department works with Deputy Sector Navigator, Andrea Vizenor of the Bay Region: Retail, Hospitality, and Tourism Sector. We are in frequent communication with Ms. Vizenor, regarding student employment opportunities and job fairs. As well, we provide Ms. Vizenor with data regarding student employment and graduation.

- In which ways is your discipline/department/program collaborating with other community colleges in the region? What similar programs exist in the surrounding area or nearby colleges?
  - There are no collaborative programs in place. With regard to similar existing programs, San Francisco City College, Diablo Valley Community College and Santa Rosa Community College all offer culinary programs.
- Is your discipline/department/program currently participating in any grants? Please list and briefly describe the grant name, granting agency and the goals of the grant as it relates to your discipline/department/program.

| Grant Name | Granting Agency                                 | Grant Goals   |
|------------|---|---|
| Perkins    | Office of Vocational and Adult Education (OVAE) | The Perkins Act defines vocational-technical education as organized educational programs offering sequences of courses directly related to preparing individuals for paid or unpaid employment in current or emerging occupations requiring other than a baccalaureate or advanced degree |
|            |   |   |

---

## 9. Professional Development:

- Please describe the professional development needs of your discipline or department. Include specifics such as training in the use of classroom technology, use of online resources, instructional methods, cultural sensitivity, faculty mentoring, etc.
- - We would welcome professional development classes that really help us make positive advancements in our teaching. We would definitely appreciate and benefit from various training like: classroom technology, online platforms, professional chef- instructor skill development courses, cutting edge culinary techniques and applications. Support in this area would be exponentially beneficial to our program and successful Student Learning Outcomes.
- How do you train instructors in the use of Distance Education platforms? Is this sufficient?

No one has offered the Culinary Arts department any training on distance education. We would be interested in learning how to adapt some of our lecture classes into this platform.

---

## 10. Discipline, Department or Program Goals and Activities:

- Briefly describe and discuss the discipline, department or program goals and activities for the next three years, including the rationale for setting these goals. NOTE: Progress in attaining these goals will be assessed in subsequent years through annual program updates (APUs).
  - We have many goals, but key among these is to ensure the quality and excellence of our academic programs. In order to achieve this, we feel we must concentrate our efforts on standardizing our methodology for review and assessment of instructional areas.
  - Our department is populated with highly effective instructors who practice excellent teaching practices and motivating instruction. However, this talent and work is encapsulated in the individual. In order to ensure the health of our department as a whole, we want to develop a mechanism which will identify these exemplary traits so that they may be disseminated to other faculty for use and inspiration.
  - Ultimately, we would like to produce a baseline template for demonstration of continuous improvement and use this as a reference for future annual program updates.

- Then fill out the goal setting template included in Appendix B. which aligns your discipline, department or program goals to the college mission statement and goals and the PCCD strategic goals and institutional objectives.

- **Goal 1. Curriculum:**

We have thirty-one courses to examine and update, five of which need to be deactivated. As well, some of our courses have yet to be approved at the state level and therefore may need revision in order to ensure they meet state standards.

- **Goal 2. Assessment:**

Key to assessing our program is standardizing our methodology, identifying all quality examples and then comparing them against individual performance.

- **Goal 3. Instruction:**

Our goal is to provide our instructors with continuing professional education specific to the Culinary Arts, in order to ensure their skill set is current with industry standards.

- **Goal 4. Student Success:**

Our goal is to create a network which will ensure the availability of employment for all student alumni graduates.

- **Goal 5. Professional Development, Community, Institutional and Professional Engagement and Partnerships:**

Our goal is to partner with key hospitality industry stakeholders in our immediate area, in order to create internships for our students during their matriculation. This would require a dedicated full-time counselor to both manage and oversee.

---

- Please complete the Comprehensive Instructional Program Review Integrated Goal Setting Template included in Appendix B.

# Appendices

# Appendix A

## CTE Program Review Prioritized Resource Requests Summary for Additional (New) Resources

College: \_\_\_\_\_

Discipline, Department or Program: \_\_\_\_\_

Contact Person: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

| Resource Category                | Description | Priority Ranking (1 – 5, etc.) | Estimated Cost | Justification (page # in the program review narrative report) |
|----------------------------------|-------------|--------------------------------|----------------|---|
| Human Resources: Faculty         |             |                                |                |   |
| Human Resources: Classified      |             |                                |                |   |
| Human Resources: Student Workers |             |                                |                |   |
| Technology                       |             |                                |                |   |
| Equipment                        |             |                                |                |   |
| Supplies                         |             |                                |                |   |
| Facilities                       |             |                                |                |   |
| Professional Development         |             |                                |                |   |
| Other (specify)                  |             |                                |                |   |

# Appendix B

## PCCD Program Review Alignment of Goals Template

College:     Laney College    

Discipline, Department or Program:     Culinary Arts    

Contact Person:     Lorriann Raji and Chantal Martin    

Date:     10-30-15    

| <b>Discipline, Department or Program Goal</b>   | <b>College Goal</b>   | <b>PCCD Goal and Institutional Objective</b>   |
|---|---|--|
| 1.<br>Update curriculum, in order to accurately reflect current courses as well as industry trends. | This correlates with the college's mission of creating quality educational opportunities that respond to the needs of the local and global community. | This aligns with the ILO for Career Technical Skills:<br>"Students will demonstrate technical skills in keeping with the demands of their field of study." |
| 2.<br>Identify all quality examples for use as data for use in assessment.                          | This aligns with the college's goal of ensuring completion of the Assessment cycle for SLOs, ILOs, SSOs, IAOs and PLOs.                               | This aligns with PCCD Institutional Objective A.2<br>"Student Success"   |
| 3.<br>Continuing professional education specific to the Culinary Arts for our faculty members.      | This aligns with the college's Goal #1: "Student Success"   | This aligns with PCCD Institutional Objectives: C.2  |
| 4.<br>Creation of employment network  | This aligns with the college's  | This aligns with PCCD  |

|  |   |  |
|--|---|--|
| student alumni graduates                               | Goals #1 “Student Success” and #4 “. . . partnerships in order to advance the quality of education provided.” | Institutional Objective A.5                                |
| 5.   |   |  |
| 6.<br>Create student internships during matriculation. | This aligns with the college’s Goals #1 “Student Success” and would probably be helpful with #2, as well.     | This aligns with PCCD Institutional Objectives B.1 and B.2 |
| 7.   |   |  |
| 8.   |   |  |

## Appendix C

### Program Review Validation Form and Signature Page

**College:**

**Discipline, Department or Program:**

---

**Part I. Overall Assessment of the Program Review Report**

| Review Criteria  | Comments:<br>Explanation if the box is not checked |
|--|--|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <p>1. The narrative information is complete and all elements of the program review are addressed.</p>    |  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <p>2. The analysis of data is thorough.</p>  |  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <p>3. Conclusions and recommendations are well-substantiated and relate to the analysis of the data.</p> |  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>  |  |



|   |  |
|---|--|
| <p>4. Discipline, department or program planning goals are articulated in the report. The goals address noted areas of concern.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>5. The resource requests are connected to the discipline, department or program planning goals and are aligned to the college goals.</p> |  |
|---|--|

**Part II. Choose one of the Ratings Below and Follow the Instructions.**

| Rating  | Instructions   |
|---|--|
| <p><input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>1. Accepted.</p>               | <p>1. Complete the signatures below and submit to the Vice President of Instruction.</p>   |
| <p><input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>2. Conditionally Accepted.</p> | <p>2. Provide commentary that indicates areas in the report that require improvement and return the report to the discipline, department or program chair with a timeline for resubmission to the validation chair.</p>  |
| <p><input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>3. Not Accepted.</p>           | <p>3. Provide commentary that indicates areas in the report that require improvement and return the report to the discipline, department or program chair with instructions to revise. Notify the Dean and Vice President of Instruction of the non-accepted status.</p> |

---

**Part III. Signatures**

**Validation Team Chair**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Print Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

**Discipline, Department or Program Chair**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Print Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

**Received by Vice President of Instruction**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Print Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date



